Virginia Saltwater Development Fund
Evaluation of a Proposal for the Development of a Research or Data Collection Project

Project Number: 0606-11 **Date: August 24, 2006**

Title: K) A Genetic Assessment of the Potential for Local Depletion of Atlantic Menhaden (*Brevoortia tyrannus*) within Chesapeake Bay.

> "The Virginia Saltwater Recreational Fishing Development Fund is to be used solely for the purpose of conserving and enhancing finfish taken by recreational anglers, enforcing laws related to natural resource conservation, improving recreational fishing opportunities, obtaining necessary data and conducting research for fisheries management, and creating or restoring habitat for species taken by recreational fishermen."
>
> Code of Virginia, Section 28.2-302.3

NOTE: Please read the entire scoresheet before beginning, then provide comments, and circle ( ) the appropriate score for each item. Thank You.

A. <u>Problem Description and Resolution (20 points)</u>

1. Comment on the adequacy of the problem description, background information, knowledge of available literature/data sources, and anticipated benefits.

The Project Need is clearly stated and displays that the Principal Investigator is familiar with the current issues associated with Atlantic menhaden management and research. Currently, fishery managers are struggling with the potential for localized depletion of Atlantic menhaden in the Chesapeake Bay. This study will explore the genetic structure of the stock(s) to determine the origin of the menhaden in the Bay.

2. Describe your views on the conceptual approach to solve the problem.

The approach toward addressing the problem is appropriate. The design of the study will address one of the high priority research needs for Atlantic Menhaden as identified by the ASMFC Technical Committee.

SCORE (Circle one)	Poor				Excellent
	0	5	10	15	(20)

B. <u>Soundness of Project Design/Technical Approach (25 points)</u>

1. Is there sufficient information to technically evaluate the proposal?

Yes, the proposal provides an adequate description of the study design to technically evaluate the proposal.

2. What are the strengths/weaknesses of the project design (thoroughness, practicality, methods, integration with other work, etc.)?

The strengths of the design include the use of a proven methodology, an appropriate range of sampling sites, and collaboration with other agencies to collect samples. The overall design is not complicated, providing a high probability of achieving the project goals. The DNA analytical tools have been successfully used on similar projects.

This project will complement additional work exploring the potential for localized depletion of Atlantic menhaden within the Chesapeake Bay.

The survey design could be enhanced with an increased number of samples.

SCORE (Circle One)	Poor					Excellent
	0	5	10	15	(20)	25

C. <u>Project Management and Experience/Qualifications of Personnel (15 points)</u>

What is your opinion of the experience and capabilities of the Principal Investigator(s) to manage and conduct the work, the availability of facilities, and education and experience of assisting personnel?

The Principal Investigators have a proven track record of completing similar projects and available resources (personal, lab space, equipment) to complete the project

SCORE (Circle one)	Poor			Excellent
	0	5	10	(15)

D. **<u>Project costs (15 points)</u>**

Is the budget realistic and reasonable? Indicate any unreasonable costs.

The project is reasonable given the experience of the Principal Investigators and the scope and complexity of the work.

SCORE (circle One)	**Poor**			**Excellent**
	0	**5**	**10**	**(15)**

E. **Value of the Project to Fisheries Managers (25 points)**

Do you believe the results of this project will further management of the species described? Will the results be useful to managers?

This project is consistent with the priority research needs identified by the ASMFC Atlantic Menhaden Technical Committee. The research needs were developed to provide the necessary data to evaluate the potential for localized depletion of menhaden in the Bay.

The uncertainty associated with both immigration and emigration of menhaden for the Bay is one of the primary sources of uncertainty in developing an estimate of the Bay population of menhaden.

The results of this study, when coupled with other current studies, will provide needed information to fishery managers.

SCORE (circle one)	**Poor**					**Excellent**
	0	**5**	**10**	**15**	**(20)**	**25**

PLEASE ADD ANY FURTHER COMMENTS ON THE PROPOSALS BELOW: